

**THE STATES assembled on Tuesday
18th July 2006, at 9.30 a.m. under
the Presidency of the Greffier of the States,
Mr. Michael Nelson de la Haye.**

**His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor,
Lieutenant-General Andrew Peter Ridgway, C.B., C.B.E.,
was present.**

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Wendy Kinnard – en défaut (défaut raised at 09.36 a.m.)
Senator Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf – en défaut (défaut raised at 09.38 a.m.)
Senator Frederick Ellyer Cohen – en défaut (défaut raised at 09.56 a.m.)
Connétable Thomas John du Feu of St. Peter– en défaut (défaut raised at 09.36 a.m.)
Deputy Peter Nicholas Troy of St. Brelade– en défaut (défaut raised at 09.36 a.m.)
Deputy Anne Enid Pryke of Trinity – excused (arrived in the Chamber at 11.19 a.m.)

Prayers.

Train bombings, Mumbai, India 11th July 2006 – message of sympathy to the Indian High Commissioner

THE STATES noted a letter of sympathy, which had been sent by the Bailiff on behalf of the States of Jersey and the people of the Island to His Excellency Mr. Kamalesh Sharma, High Commissioner of India, London expressing deep sympathy at the suffering and loss of life caused by the train bombings in Mumbai, India on 11th July 2006.

Subordinate enactments tabled

The following enactments were tabled, namely –

Road Racing (Hill Climbs and Sprint) (No. 3) (Jersey) Order 2006. <i>Minister for Transport and Technical Services.</i>	R&O 74/2006.
Motor Traffic (Cabs – Fares and Charges) (Amendment) (Jersey) Order 2006. <i>Minister for Transport and Technical Services.</i>	R&O 75/2006.

Documents presented or laid

Report and Accounts 2005: Social Security Department. Presented: 10th July 2006. <i>Minister for Social Security.</i>	R.57/2006.
Land Transactions under Standing Order 168(3) – Turnstone, 6 Fisherman's Wharf, Grève de Lecq, St. Ouen: sale under the Assisted House Purchase Scheme. Presented: 12th July 2006. <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources.</i>	R.58/2006.
Jersey Overseas Aid Commission: annual report for 2005. Presented: 18th July 2006. <i>Overseas Aid Commission.</i>	R.59/2006.

Social Affairs Scrutiny Panel: division to create a fifth scrutiny panel (P.64/2006) – comments. Presented: 18th July 2006. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.64/2006. Com. (2)
Island Plan 2002, Policy H2: Field 91, St. Clement (P.70/2006)– comments. Presented: 13th July 2006. <i>Minister for Planning and Environment.</i>	P.70/2006. Com.
Island Plan 2002, Policy H2: Field 91, St. Clement (P.70/2006)– comments. Presented: 14th July 2006. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.70/2006. Com. (2)

Notification of lodged propositions

Goods and Services Tax: exempt or zero-rated items (P.86/2006) – amendment. Lodged: 7th July 2006. <i>Deputy A. Breckon of St. Saviour.</i>	P.86/2006. Amd.
Draft Health Care (Registration) (Jersey) Regulations 200-. Lodged: 17th July 2006. <i>Minister for Health and Social Services.</i>	P.91/2006.
Annual Business Plan 2007. Lodged: 18th July 2006. <i>Chief Minister.</i>	P.92/2006.
Income Tax: exemption thresholds, allowances and a higher rate. Lodged: 18th July 2006. <i>Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier.</i>	P.93/2006.

Written Questions

[\(see Official Report\)](#)

The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture tabled an answer to a question asked by Senator Ben Edward Shenton regarding comparative contributions made by parents of students attending university from other jurisdictions.

The Minister for Social Security tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier regarding budget standards for household types.

The Minister for Housing tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier regarding consents granted under the 'j' category housing policy.

The Minister for Home Affairs tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy Sarah Craig Ferguson of St. Brelade regarding standards and costs of the States of Jersey Police.

Oral Questions

[\(see Official Report\)](#)

Deputy Sarah Craig Ferguson of St. Brelade asked a question of the Minister for Home Affairs regarding receipt and circulation of the inspection report by Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary.

Deputy Gerard Clifford Lemmens Baudains of St. Clement asked a question of the Minister for Home Affairs regarding the functions of the States of Jersey Police under the Minister's responsibility and the accountability of the Police.

Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Treasury and Resources regarding the progress made towards developing a policy for the full or partial sale of States investments in utility companies such as the Jersey Electricity Company Limited and Jersey New Waterworks Company Limited.

Deputy Gerard Clifford Lemmens Baudains of St. Clement asked a question of the Minister for Social Security regarding details of unwanted prescription drugs returned to dispensing pharmacies.

The Connétable of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Education, Sport and Culture regarding the Minister's confidence in the Board of the Jersey Opera House.

Senator Ben Edward Shenton asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding the possible sale of Jersey Telecom.

Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding the provision of legal advice to both the executive and non-executive arms of government.

Deputy Roy George Le Hérisssier of St. Saviour asked a question of the Minister for Economic Development regarding the withdrawal of funding for the summer International Football Event.

Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier of St. Saviour asked a question of the Chairman, Comité des Connétables regarding the causes for the low return of electoral registration forms in the current year.

The Connétable of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Transport and Technical Services regarding an application by the Parish of St. Helier's to implement a business and residential parking scheme in the Cheapside and Kensington Place areas.

The Deputy of St. Mary asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding progress on the establishment of a 'Citizen's Panel'

Oral Questions without notice

[\(see Official Report\)](#)

The Minister for Health and Social Services answered questions without notice from members.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services answered questions without notice from members.

Howard Davis Farm, Trinity: part of Fields 562, 827 and 828 – sale of land (P.68/2006) – statement

[\(see Official Report\)](#)

The Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee made a statement regarding the report of that Committee on P.68/2006 – Howard Davis Farm, Trinity: part of Fields 562, 827 and 828 – sale of land.

Establishment of a Scrutiny Sub-Panel to examine the viability of the dairy industry – statement

[\(see Official Report\)](#)

The Chairman of the Economic Affairs Scrutiny Panel made a statement regarding the establishment of a Sub-Panel to examine the viability of the dairy industry.

Island Plan 2002, Policy H2: Field 91, St. Clement (P.70/2006)– statement

[\(see Official Report\)](#)

The Minister for Planning and Environment made a statement regarding the proposition of Deputy Ian Joseph Gorst of St. Clement regarding the Island Plan 2002, Policy H2: Field 91, St. Clement (P.70/2006 lodged 'au Greffe' on 6th June 2006).

**Island Plan 2002, Policy H2: Field 91, St. Clement– P.70/2006
Comments**

THE STATES rejected a proposition of Deputy Ian Joseph Gorst of St. Clement requesting that they refer to their Act dated 11th July 2002, in which they approved the revised draft Island Plan as a Development Plan under Article 3 of the Island Planning (Jersey) Law 1964, as amended, and that they request the Minister for Planning and Environment to amend the Island Plan 2002 to provide that Field 91, La Grande Route de Côte, St. Clement, be designated as an important open space in accordance with Policy BE8 of the said Plan.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 14

Senator L. Norman
Connétable of St. Mary
Connétable of St. Clement
Connétable of St. Lawrence
Connétable of St. Brelade
Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)

Deputy P.J.D. Ryan (H)
Deputy of St. Peter
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
Deputy D.W. Mezbourian
(L)
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
Deputy S. Pitman (H)
Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)

CONTRE: 27

Senator F.H. Walker
Senator W. Kinnard
Senator T.A. Le Sueur
Senator P.F. Routier
Senator M.E. Vibert
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
Senator T.J. Le Main

Senator B.E. Shenton
Senator J.L. Perchard
Connétable of Trinity

Connétable of St. Martin
Deputy A. Breckon (S)
Deputy J.J. Huet (H)
Deputy of St. Martin
Deputy C.J. Scott Warren
(S)
Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)
Deputy of St. Ouen
Deputy of Grouville
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
Deputy of St. John
Deputy of St. Mary

ABSTAIN: 8

Senator F.E. Cohen
Connétable of St. Saviour
Connétable of St. Helier
Connétable of Grouville
Connétable of St. John
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
Deputy of Trinity
Deputy A.J.H. Maclean
(H)

Change in Presidency

The Deputy Bailiff assumed the presidency during consideration of the proposition of Deputy Ian Joseph Gorst of St. Clement regarding the Island Plan 2002, Policy H2: Field 91, St. Clement (P.70/2006 lodged at the Greffe" on 6th June 2006), and the meeting continued under his presidency.

**Draft Jersey College for Girls (Removal of Covenants from Former Site) (Jersey) Law 200- P.62/2006
(re-issue)**

THE STATES, subject to the sanction of Her Most Excellent Majesty in Council, adopted a Law entitled the Jersey College for Girls (Removal of Covenants from Former Site) (Jersey) Law 200-.

Income Tax: allowances, reliefs and exemption thresholds (“20 means 20”) – P.58/2006

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of the Minister for Treasury and Resources regarding income tax allowances, reliefs and exemption thresholds and, following consideration, rejected a proposition of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier that, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 83, the proposition be referred back.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 22

Senator B.E. Shenton
Connétable of St. Peter
Connétable of St. Clement
Connétable of St. Helier
Connétable of St. Martin
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
Deputy A. Breckon (S)
Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)
Deputy P.N. Troy (B)
Deputy C.J. Scott Warren (S)
Deputy R.G. Le Hérisse (S)
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)
Deputy of St. Ouen
Deputy P.J.D. Ryan (H)
Deputy of Grouville
Deputy D.W. Mezbourian (L)
Deputy of Trinity
Deputy S. Pitman (H)
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
Deputy of St. John

CONTRE: 27

Senator L. Norman
Senator F.H. Walker
Senator W. Kinnard
Senator T.A. Le Sueur
Senator P.F. Routier
Senator M.E. Vibert
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
Senator T.J. Le Main
Senator F.E. Cohen
Senator J.L. Perchard
Connétable of St. Ouen
Connétable of St. Saviour
Connétable of St. Mary
Connétable of Trinity
Connétable of St. Lawrence
Connétable of Grouville
Connétable of St. John

Connétable of St. Brelade
Deputy of St. Martin
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
Deputy of St. Peter
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
Deputy of St. Mary

ABSTAIN: 0

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Minister for Treasury and Resources, referred to their Act dated 13th May 2005, in which they agreed a progressive package of tax and benefits, and agreed –

- (a) that all tax allowances and reliefs, other than approved pension contributions, allowable employment expenses, child allowance, additional personal allowance and allowances on the first £1,000 of life assurance premiums on all policies in existence as at 31st December 2006, should be phased out over a five-year period, commencing 1st January 2007, for those paying income tax at the standard rate of 20%;
- (b) that exemption thresholds for all taxpayers should be increased by 2.5% for the years of assessment 2007, 2008 and 2009; and,
- (c) that the option for all taxpayers to continue to receive all exemptions and allowances and to pay tax at the marginal rate of 27% should be retained following the introduction of the changes set out in (a) and (b) above.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 38

CONTRE: 10

ABSTAIN: 0

Senator L. Norman
Senator F.H. Walker
Senator W. Kinnard
Senator T.A. Le Sueur
Senator P.F. Routier
Senator M.E. Vibert
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
Senator F.E. Cohen
Senator J.L. Perchard
Connétable of St. Ouen
Connétable of St. Saviour
Connétable of St. Mary
Connétable of St. Peter
Connétable of St. Clement
Connétable of St. Helier
Connétable of Trinity
Connétable of St. Lawrence
Connétable of Grouville
Connétable of St. John
Connétable of St. Brelade
Connétable of St. Martin
Deputy of St. Martin
Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)
Deputy C.J. Scott Warren (S)
Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)
Deputy of St. Ouen
Deputy P.J.D. Ryan (H)
Deputy of Grouville
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
Deputy D.W. Mezbourian
(L)
Deputy of Trinity
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
Deputy of St. Mary

Senator S. Syvret
Senator T.J. Le Main
Senator B.E. Shenton
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
Deputy A. Breckon (S)
Deputy P.N. Troy (B)
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
Deputy S. Pitman (H)
Deputy of St. John

Adjournment

THE STATES then adjourned, having agreed to reconvene the next day, Wednesday 19th July 2006, in order to continue consideration of the outstanding matters of public business.

THE STATES rose at 5.36 p.m.

M.N. DE LA HAYE

Greffier of the States